



Report to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee 13th September 2017

Report of: Policy and Improvement Officer

Subject: Written responses to public questions on 27th July 2017

Author of Report: Alice Nicholson, Policy and Improvement Officer
alice.nicholson@sheffield.gov.uk
 0114 273 5065

Summary:

This report provides the Committee with copies of written responses to public questions asked at the Committee's meeting on Thursday 27th July 2017.

The responses are included as part of the Committee's meeting papers as the way of collating response, either in minutes or subsequently provided by officers and placing the responses on the public record, it includes responses to technical questions raised by members of the Committee at the meeting.

Type of item: The report author should tick the appropriate box

| | |
|---|----------|
| Reviewing of existing policy | |
| Informing the development of new policy | |
| Statutory consultation | |
| Performance / budget monitoring report | |
| Cabinet request for scrutiny | |
| Full Council request for scrutiny | |
| Community Assembly request for scrutiny | |
| Call-in of Cabinet decision | |
| Briefing paper for the Scrutiny Committee | |
| Other | X |

The Scrutiny Committee is being asked to:

Note the report

Background Papers: None

Category of Report: OPEN

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Nigel Slack at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

With reference to third recommendation of the Working Group - what was meant by “practicable and affordable” and who would decide what is “practicable and affordable”?

That consideration of practicable and affordable solutions rested with the Cabinet Member as the decision maker.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Denise Fox, Chair of Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee

Streets Ahead can confirm that full consideration has been given and that includes commissioning of additional exploratory excavation work that was carried out.

Supplementary information at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Question 2

Why were the only ‘technical’ consultations with council or AMEY staff?

Cllr Lisa Banes confirmed that technical evidence had not been considered as it was outside of the Working Group’s remit, but would be forwarded to the Cabinet Member for consideration. She clarified that technical experts had been from the Council and not from AMEY.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Elizabeth Motley at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

Elizabeth Motley referred to drawings she submitted to the Working Group which proposed solutions to the tree roots problem on Western Road, and asked whether they had been considered by the Working Party and whether they had been used or acted on?

Cllr Lisa Banes confirmed that the drawings had been considered alongside other community evidence that had been submitted. She advised that it had not been in the Working Party's scope to consider technical evidence, that the information would be submitted to the Cabinet Member.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Written version sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Arthur Baker at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

With regard fourth recommendation of the Working Group, what was meant by original concept?

“We recommend that the Council look to restoring over time the Western Road War Memorial to its original concept. This would be subject to appropriate space, funding, and **agreement with residents on Western Road and Mona Avenue**”

Cllr Lisa Banes confirmed that the original concept referred to restoring the memorial to the original number of 97 trees, including replanting the lost trees (in consultation with residents), and advised that conversations with the War Memorial Trust regarding potential funding had begun.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Subsequent response of interest: Consideration will be given as to whether a funding bid to War Memorial Trust (WMT) would be appropriate following the Cabinet decision on the scrutiny recommendations. However, WMT have indicated that funding is unlikely as their funding pot has already been allocated for the coming financial years.

Response at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Question 2

Mr Baker criticised the Working Group’s engagement with residents, and referred to a leaflet that had been circulated by the Council which did not mention the word ‘tree’.

Councillor Lisa Banes confirmed that she had spoken to residents on 9th March who had raised concerns over the planned process for engagement. In light of this, the Working Group invited residents and community groups to ‘open interview’ style meetings scheduled for a variety of times, and accepted written and emailed representations. This enabled the Group to consult with as many people as possible and accept broader feedback. Councillor Banes confirmed that the word “trees” was absent on the leaflet but emphasised that trees were understood to be an intrinsic part of the memorial, and the leaflet was not meant to diminish their significance.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Alan Story at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

With reference to the Working Group's report that "trees are part of the memorial but not necessarily those specific trees", Alan Story advised that the trees had originally been paid for by the public with the Council now the guardian and steward of them, and questioned why the trees were being replaced and how many would be cut down?

Question 2

Have the War Memorial Trust expressed an opinion regarding tree replacement?

Councillor Lisa Banes acknowledged that this was a highly emotive topic and it was appreciated that residents had questions that this Working Group had been unable to consider. She highlighted the third recommendation, which advocated the retention of as many trees as possible, and advised that this was as far as the Group could go without impinging on the remit of the Independent Tree Panel. With regards to the War Memorial Trust she noted that, as potential funders, they were obligated to remain impartial.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Consideration will be given as to whether a funding bid to War Memorial Trust (WMT) would be appropriate following the Cabinet decision on the scrutiny recommendations. However, WMT have indicated that funding is unlikely as their funding pot has already been allocated for the coming financial years.

Supplementary information at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Cllr Craig Gamble Pugh at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

Asked if the detailed submission he put together, after speaking to a large percentage of local resident, had been considered by the Working Group?

Question 2

Asked whether the Working Group were aware of traffic schemes that were being proposed for the area which might be able to incorporate the memorial trees?

Councillor Banes confirmed that Councillor Gamble Pugh's submission had been considered by the Group alongside community representations, and advised that AMEY had not been consulted or asked to give evidence to the Working Group. She suggested that details of the traffic schemes should be referred to the Cabinet Member for consideration alongside other technical evidence.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Subsequent Response of Interest: There are no proposals to change any restrictions at Westways School as part of the School Entrance Review programme. On the Transport list of requests for restrictions there is one request for double yellow lines at the junction with Slinn Street and a request for resident's parking, neither of which have been prioritised for action.

Response at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Reuben Fowles at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

What are the species of tree that would be replanted in Western Road?

The current avenue is a mix of mainly Ash, Sycamore and London Plane. The replacement trees are a combination of Lime, Turkish Hazel, Ermann Birch and Maple.

Below is a list of replacement and additional tree species:-

- Replanting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - o/s 260-262
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - opp bay window 243
- Replanting - Corylus colurna - opp 231. pit
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 198-200. pit
- Planting - Tilia 'Rancho' - o/s 156 (Between 156 and school)
- Replanting - Corylus colurna - o/s 140-142
- Replanting - Acer rubrum 'October Glory' - opp 87. pit
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 92-94
- Replanting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - o/s 70. pit
- Replanting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - side off 214 school road
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 62-64. Relocated due to services. Pit
- Replanting - Corylus colurna - o/s 53-55. pit
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 57-59
- Replanting - Acer rubrum 'October Glory' - o/s 76-78. Relocated due to telegraph pole. Pit
- Planting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - o/s 81. pit
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 93
- Replanting - Betula ermanii - o/s 107-109. Relocated due to lighting column. Pit
- Planting - Corylus colurna - o/s 115 pit
- Replanting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - o/s 123
- Planting - Tilia 'Rancho' - Plant in new 800mm pit o/s 143 (same as felled tree)
- Replanting - Tilia cordata 'Rancho' - o/s 209. pit
- Replanting - Acer rubrum 'October Glory' - o/s 219-221
- Replanting - Corylus colurna - o/s 271. pit

Response at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Marie Miller at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

Queried the Council's lack of maintenance, citing a recent incident of tree trunks being tarmacked to an extreme degree?

Tarmacking up to a tree in the short term does not damage a tree, however, any examples of this practice will be amended to create tree pits.

On Western road temporary surfacing was laid after the exploratory works to keep the pavements safe until permanent works are completed.

The lack of historic maintenance is being addressed by the Streets Ahead programme and the contract covers maintenance for the coming 20 years.

Response provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Response sent by email on Tuesday 5th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Public Questions**

Response to the public questions raised by Brian Mosley at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

With regard recommendations and tree maintenance, will the Committee be pursuing and following-up outside of this exercise?

Councillor Banes agreed that ensuring this exercise was followed up with ongoing care and a proactive maintenance plan was essential, and this was highlighted in the report at recommendation two. With regard to the second question, Councillor Banes replied that any replacement trees would be older than saplings but confirmed that detail would be provided in a written response by the relevant officer.

Response provided at the meeting by: Cllr Lisa Banes, Chair of Western Road First World War Memorial Scrutiny Task and Finish Working Group

Question 2

Asked that where replacements must be made for mature trees, asked that saplings not be used?

Replacement trees are as the replacement trees on the rest of Streets Ahead and are 8-10 years old depending on the tree species.

Supplementary information at request of Committee provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Response sent by email on Monday 4th September 2017

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development
Committee
Thursday 27th July 2017
Members Technical Questions**

Response to technical questions raised by members of the Committee at the meeting held on Thursday 27th July 2017.

Question 1

In the Council's technical report, please confirm if last column (*Streets Ahead Recommends*) is final recommendation for action under contract?

The technical report is the final recommendation from Streets Ahead subject to confirmation from Cabinet following the scrutiny process.

Response provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Question 2

Will a War Memorial Trust (WMT) funding bid be submitted?

Consideration will be given as to whether a funding bid to WMT would be appropriate following the Cabinet decision on the scrutiny recommendations. However, WMT have indicated that funding is unlikely as their funding pot has already been allocated for the coming financial years.

Response provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment

Question 3

What is age of replacement trees?

Replacement trees are as the replacement trees on the rest of Streets Ahead and are 8-10 years old depending on the tree species

Response provided by: Paul Billington, Director of Culture and Environment